



### Russian Federation's Compliance with International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights Treaty Suggested List of Issues Relating to Discrimination Based on Sexual orientation, Gender Identity, and Gender Expression

Submitted by The Advocates for Human Rights a non-governmental organization in special consultative status with ECOSOC since 1996 and

**Moscow Community Center for LGBTQ+ Initiatives** 

129th Session of the Human Rights Committee 29 June 2020–25 July 2020

### Submitted 1 June 2020

**The Advocates for Human Rights** (The Advocates) is a volunteer-based non-governmental organization committed to the impartial promotion and protection of international human rights standards and the rule of law. Established in 1983, The Advocates conducts a range of programs to promote human rights in the United States and around the world, including monitoring and fact finding, direct legal representation, education and training, and publications.

**Moscow Community Center for LGBT+ Initiatives** (MCC) was established in 2015 as a resource for LGBT+ initiatives in the greater Moscow region of the Russian Federation. It is a volunteer-based organization where community members can experience an atmosphere of friendship, support, and acceptance. MCC initiates and implements unique projects serving LGBT individuals, including legal services and psychosocial care. Through education and outreach, the Center is committed to bringing together the region's activists to build an LGBTQI movement in Moscow and across Russia and to fight anti-gay discrimination.

### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

- 1. Russian authorities continue to engage in and create a climate of impunity for widespread violence, discrimination, harassment, and murders of LGBTI persons.
- 2. The Advocates for Human Rights has received direct information about harassment, violence and ill-treatment targeting LGBTI persons in Russia from clients seeking asylum in the United States.<sup>1</sup> Their experiences corroborate information from the Moscow Community Center and other sources demonstrating that laws and policies in Russia fail to provide LGBTI individuals with adequate protection against human rights violations.

### Russia fails to uphold its obligations under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

## I. Russia has failed to take measures to reduce violence and discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation and gender identity and expression. (Concluding Observations Paragraph 10(a))

- 3. In its 2015 Concluding Observations, the Human Rights Committee, expressed concern that Russia has failed to address discrimination on the grounds of sexual orientation, including violence and hate speech.<sup>2</sup> The Committee noted that anti-discrimination legislation in Russia does not explicitly protect against discrimination on the grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity, and that authorities have never applied article 63, paragraph 1(e) of the Criminal Code, recognizing "hatred or enmity" as an aggravating circumstance, in any case involving violence against LGBT individuals.<sup>3</sup>
- 4. The Committee recommended that the Russian Federation "clearly and officially state that it does not tolerate any form of social stigmatization of homosexuality, bisexuality or transexuality, or hate speech, discrimination or violence against persons based on their sexual orientation or gender identity." It further recommended that the Russian Federation "[t]ake all the steps necessary to strengthen the legal framework protecting LGBT individuals from discrimination and violence and ensure the investigation, prosecution and punishment of any act of violence motivated by the victim's sexual orientation or gender identity and apply the provisions of article 63, paragraph 1(e) of the Criminal Code to such acts."
- 5. In its Eighth Periodic Report, the government of the Russian Federation asserts that discrimination based on sexual orientation or gender identity is prohibited.<sup>4</sup> The Report further notes that Article 3 of the Labour law prohibits discrimination against individuals on any grounds except for the individuals' professional competencies and emphasized that although the list of protections under that law does not explicitly list sexual orientation, the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The case information presented in this submission is compiled from intake and other interviews conducted by The Advocates for Human Rights with asylum seekers from Russia between 2015 and 2020 (hereinafter referred to as "Interviews conducted by The Advocates (2015-2020)"). Some details have been removed to maintain confidentiality and to protect the identifies of clients and their families. Information is used with permission.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Human Rights Committee, *Concluding Observations on the Seventh Periodic Report of the Russian Federation*, (Apr. 28, 2015), U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, ¶ 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Human Rights Committee, *Eighth Report Submitted by the Russian Federation under Article 40 of the Covenant, due in 2019*, (Apr. 8, 2019), U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/RUS/8, ¶ 370.

list is non-exhaustive and implies that all other grounds—including sexual orientation—are captured by the law.<sup>5</sup>

- 6. The Report also states that "in criminal proceedings the sexual orientation of the victim is of no significance,"<sup>6</sup> conceding that hatred or enmity based on sexual orientation or gender identity is not an aggravating circumstance, contrary to the Committee's recommendation.
- 7. In a quest to eradicate Chechen separatist groups and gain control over the region, the Russian government encouraged Chechen authorities to prosecute and torture people alleged to have incited separatist notion. Chechen authorities used this discretion to eliminate dissent, defined broadly, including by targeting people on the basis of sexual orientation or gender identity. As a result, hundreds of LGBTI individuals have been imprisoned for their sexual orientation.<sup>7</sup> As of January 17, 2019, Chechen authorities continue to carry out large-scale arrests of LGBTI individuals.<sup>8</sup> According to Amnesty International, between December 2018 and January 2019, Chechen authorities arrested 40 LGBTI individuals and at least two individuals died during that period as a result of torture in Chechnya.<sup>9</sup>
- 8. Accounts of LGBTI individuals in the Chechen region being picked up by the police and interrogated about their sexual orientation, and then tortured through water torture, electrocution, starvation, and armed beatings continue. Mass detentions and raids by Chechen authorities of individuals suspected of homosexuality appear to have begun in Chechnya in early 2017. Despite these accounts, Chechen authorities deny all wrong-doing and in an alarming manner insist that gay individuals do not exist in Chechnya.<sup>10</sup> Russian authorities generally disregard these abuses.<sup>11</sup> Victims have been excluded from avenues of obtaining justice through the Russian legal system. In one account by an LGBTI individual, prosecutors refused to open a case when presented with claims of abuse by police.<sup>12</sup> There are widespread reports of LGBTI individuals being killed by family members in Chechnya, often with the encouragement of law enforcement officials.<sup>13</sup> Entrapment and torture of LGBTI individuals by vigilante groups has also been reported in Russia.<sup>14</sup>
- 9. Discrimination, harassment, and threats of violence against LGBTI have increased in recent years, coinciding with the government's rhetoric that LGBTI relationships are a threat to traditional families. A survey conducted in 2017 of more than 1600 people found that 81% of respondents disapprove of same-sex relationships. The same survey found that in the last 20

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> *Id.* ¶¶ 371–372.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> *Id.* ¶ 373.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Russian LGBT Network, *'They Said that I'm not a Human, that I am Nothing, that I Should Rather be a Terrorist, than a Faggot' LGBT Persecution in the North Caucasus: a Report*, by Russian LGBT Network in cooperation with Elena Milashina (Saint Petersburg: 2018), https://lgbtnet.org/sites/default/files/doklad\_web.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Natalia Prilutskaya, *Putin has Given Chechnya Free Rein to Persecute LGBTI People*, The Moscow Times, Jan. 17, 2019, https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2019/01/17/putin-has-given-chechnya-free-rein-to-persecute-lgbt-people-a64172.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Masha Gessen, "The Gay Men Who Fled Chechnya's Purge," *The New Yorker*, Jun. 26, 2017, https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2017/07/03/the-gay-men-who-fled-chechnyas-purge.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Masha Gessen, "A Damning New Report on L.G.B.T. Persecution in Chechnya", *The New Yorker*, Dec. 21, 2018, https://www.newyorker.com/news/our-columnists/a-damning-new-report-on-lgbt-persecution-in-chechnya.
<sup>12</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Masha Gessen, "The Year Russian L.G.B.T. Persecution Defied Belief", *The New Yorker*, Dec. 29, 2017, https://www.newyorker.com/culture/2017-in-review/the-year-russian-lgbt-persecution-defied-belief.
<sup>14</sup> Ibid.

years such disapproval rose by 23%.<sup>15</sup> Although in 2008 the proportion of respondents disapproving of same-sex relationships was statistically lower for people between the ages of 18 and 31, such disapproval increased among younger respondents in the 2017 survey.<sup>16</sup>

- 10. A survey conducted by the Russian LGBT Network in 2020 among 6,598 people primarily identifying as LGBTI and living in Russia, found that 11.6% of the respondents have experienced physical violence at least once and 56.2% experienced mental violence, in connection with their sexual orientation.<sup>17</sup> Further, such LGBTI individuals feel the highest levels of discrimination at their places of employment.<sup>18</sup> Respondents reported discrimination and injustice due to their sexual orientation in all other aspects of their lives, including unlawful detention, inability to access healthcare, inability to access products, services and parental rights, discrimination in housing, property damage, and unauthorized access to their information.<sup>19</sup>
- 11. A firsthand account from a client of The Advocates is consistent with reports of discrimination against LGBTI individuals from secondary sources. This gay man reported experiencing repeated abuse from private parties, law enforcement, and medical personnel. He was assaulted and called derogatory names after exiting a gay nightclub and again by a taxi driver who learned that the man was gay. The driver hit him in the face and knocked him unconscious. A doctor refused to provide medical treatment due to his HIV-positive status. He is afraid to return to Russia because of stories of acquaintances being assaulted and even murdered as a result of anti-LGBTI discrimination.<sup>20</sup>
- 12. Corruption in the law enforcement in Russia remains a serious problem<sup>21</sup> and allows law enforcement officials to feed off of LGBTI individuals' fears of prosecution as a result of their LGBTI identification. Evidencing this, an LGBTI client of The Advocates reported being detained by a police officer who saw him with another man in a car, and the officer threatened to charge him with pedophilia when he refused to pay a bribe.<sup>22</sup>

# **II.** Russia has enacted additional laws that promote discrimination based on sexual orientation and gender identity and expression and continues to enforce existing discriminatory laws. (Concluding Observations Paragraph 10(b)-(c))

13. In its 2015 Concluding Observations, the Committee expressed concern that laws adopted at the regional and federal levels banning "promotion of non-traditional sexual relations to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Levada Center, *Taboo in the Field of Sex and Reproduction*, Nov. 1, 2018, https://www.levada.ru/2018/01/11/17389/?fromtg=1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Russian LGBT Network, *Monitoring Discrimination Against LGBTQ+ People in Russia. Quantitative Data* (2020), by Kseniia Kamarina, Daniil Zhaivoronok (2020), (96.8% of those surveyed identified as LGBTI). https://lgbtnet.org/sites/default/files/monitoring\_data\_report\_2019.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> *Id.* at 10 (13.4% of those surveyed reported experiencing discriminations at their place of employment, 10.5% had to mask personal information in the employment process to be hired).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> *Id.* at 11 (of those surveyed 152 faced unlawful detention, 294 faced inability to access health care services, 440 experienced rights violations and inability to access parental rights, 316 face housing discrimination, 738 experienced damage to property and 1,113 faced unauthorized access to their information).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Interviews conducted by The Advocates (2015-2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Gregory Satarov and Mark Levin, *Corruption and Institutions in Russia*, 16 European Journal of Political Economy, 113 (the report outlines that Russian institutions have succumbed to corruption after the collapse of the Soviet Union). https://doi.org/10.1016/S0176-2680(99)00050-6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Interviews conducted by The Advocates (2015-2020).

minors . . . exacerbate the negative stereotypes against LGBT individuals and represent a disproportionate restriction of their rights under the Covenant."<sup>23</sup> The Committee also expressed concern that a 2014 decree "included transgender identity, bi-gender identity, asexuality and cross-dressing in the list of medical conditions constituting contraindications to driving."<sup>24</sup>

- 14. The Committee recommended that the Russian federation repeal all laws banning "promotion of non-traditional sexual relations to minors" and "[e]xclude transgender identity, bi-gender identity, asexuality and cross-dressing from the list of medical conditions constituting contraindications to driving."<sup>25</sup>
- 15. In June 2013, Russian President Vladimir Putin signed into federal law the law "aimed at protecting children from information promoting the denial of traditional family values" which deems it unlawful to promote "nontraditional sexual relations to minors", including the provision of information over media channels and the internet.
- 16. The Eighth Periodic Report asserts that the law "prohibiting the promotion of non-traditional sexual relations to minors . . . does not entail interference in individual autonomy, including sexual self-determination. The purpose of the provision is not to prohibit or officially stigmatize non-traditional sexual relations and it does not hinder public discussion on the legal status of sexual minorities or the use by their representatives of all legal means of expressing their opinion on these issues and defending their rights and interests, including by organizing and holding public events. The only acts that can be deemed unlawful are public acts intended to disseminate information promoting non-traditional sexual relations among minors or imposing such relations on them, including as a result of the circumstances in which the act was committed. This has allowed for a balance to be reached between the rights of sexual minorities and the rights of minors."<sup>26</sup>
- 17. The Eighth Periodic Report makes no reference to the Committee's recommendation regarding eligibility to obtain a driving license.
- 18. Russia has not taken steps to amend or address the negative impact of the nontraditional family values act, but rather has increased arrests and proposed new laws that have a detrimental impact on LGBTI individuals in Russia. Among other constitutional amendments proposed by the president of Russia, Vladimir Putin, one aims to revise the constitution to explicitly define marriage as a union between a man and a woman and in effect ban same-sex marriage.<sup>27</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Human Rights Committee, *Concluding Observations on the Seventh Periodic Report of the Russian Federation*, (Apr. 28, 2015), U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, ¶ 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Human Rights Committee, *Eighth Report Submitted by the Russian Federation under Article 40 of the Covenant, due in 2019*, (Apr. 8, 2019), U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/RUS/8, ¶¶ 374-76.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Russia's Putin Wants Traditional Marriage and God in Constitution, BBC, Mar. 3, 2020, https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-51719764; and Andrew Kramer, Putin Proposes Constitutional Ban on Gay Marriage, The New York Times, 3 March 2020, https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/03/world/europe/putin-proposes-constitutional-ban-on-gay-marriage.html (the vote on the constitutional amendments proposed by Vladimir Putin was scheduled for April 22, 2020; however, it has been postponed indefinitely due to the effects of COVID-19).

- 19. Despite Russia's Labour law, the law prohibiting promotion of non-traditional sexual relations to minors has been used as a vehicle to prosecute and silence LGBTI individuals due to their perceived threats to the traditional family.<sup>28</sup> In June 2017, the European Court of Human Rights (ECHR) declared the law discriminatory.<sup>29</sup>
- 20. A Russian LGBTI activist, Yulia Tsvetkova was arrested and later found to have committed an administrative offense of violating the law "aimed at protecting children from information promoting the denial of traditional family values" as a result of posting imagery of women's bodies in relation to a statement about traditional perception of female bodies, on the Russian social network platform, "VKontakte." Such posts were ruled to be "propaganda of non-traditional sexual relations." It was further ruled that no direct evidence of children under 18 years old having access to such posted information is necessary given that there is a mere possibility of access due to the public nature of the account and thousands of children between ages 16 and 18 using the social platform.<sup>30</sup> The law was also used to prosecute Tsvetkova despite there being no evidence of whether she herself posted the information or owned the account, portraying the unfair and discriminatory nature of the proceedings in connection with the law.
- 21. Moreover, the administrative proceedings against Tsvetkova were neither fair nor impartial. There was no prosecuting party, a violation of Tsvetkova's right to a fair and public hearing by a competent, independent, and impartial tribunal, and her right to be presumed innocent until proved guilty according to law.<sup>31</sup> Russian courts have a general practice of not requiring a prosecuting party in adjudication of alleged administrative offenses, a practice which compels the judge to perform the role of prosecutor, thereby undermining the impartiality of the court.<sup>32</sup> As the European Court of Human Rights found, "the lack of a prosecuting party [can have] an effect on the operation of the presumption of innocence during the trial and, by implication, on the question of the trial court's impartiality and vice versa."<sup>33</sup> Moreover, in such circumstances "the burden of proof is shifted from the prosecution to the defence."<sup>34</sup>

# III. Russia continues to limit the ability of members of the LGBT community to exercise their rights to freedom of expression and assembly. (Concluding Observations Paragraph 10(d))

- 22. In its 2015 Concluding Observations, the Committee recommended that the Russian Federation "[g]uarantee the exercise in practice of the rights to freedom of expression and assembly of LGBT individuals and their supporters."<sup>35</sup>
- 23. The Russian Federation's Eighth Periodic Report asserts that the 2004 Federal Act No. 54-FZ on Meetings, Rallies, Demonstrations, Marches and Picketing "does not place restrictions on

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Russia, Federal Law, No. 135-FZ, "On Amendments to Article 5 of the Federal Law on Protecting Children from Information Harmful to their Health and Development", Jun. 29, 2013, Art. 6.21.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Bayev and Others v. Russia, application nos. 67667/09, 44092/12 and 56717/12 (Jun. 20, 2017).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Tsvetkova v. Russia, case no. 12-38/2020 (Jan. 22, 2002).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Karelin v. Russian, Application No. 926/08, European Court of Human Rights (20 Sept. 2016), available at http://hudoc.echr.coe.int/eng-press?i=003-5491526-6896983.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Id. ¶ 72.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Human Rights Committee, *Concluding Observations on the Seventh Periodic Report of the Russian Federation*, (Apr. 28, 2015), U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/RUS/CO/7, ¶ 10 § (d).

the right to organize or hold public events of persons with a non-traditional sexual orientation" because the organizer of a public event may be a Russian citizen, a political party, a voluntary association, a religious association, or a regional subdivision of an organization.<sup>36</sup>

- 24. Despite this, Russia continues to use various laws, including the non-traditional family law as well as Russia's anti-pornography laws to stifle freedom of expression of LGBTI individuals. In addition to the violation of the anti-traditional family law, Yulia Tsvetkova was charged for a violation of Russia's anti-pornography laws based on uncollaborated information about her body-positive posts on the social platform "VKontakte," and when a judge was unable to hear the matter same day, held under house arrest for 14 days.<sup>37</sup>
- 25. Another instance of suppression of freedom of expression of LGBTI individuals in Russia is portrayed through the arrest of Sergei Arnautov, a LGBTI activist in Russia, under the guise of violating pornography laws through a "Vkontakte" account with a username containing the activist's name that posted a pornographic video. The police possess no evidence that such account is linked to Arnautov himself at the time of the arrest. A different account, clearly linked to Arnautov, does contain various information relating to LGBTI activism. Regardless, upon arrest the police confiscated Arnautov's phone and computer as weapons of the crime and ordered him to remain under house arrest until the end of the investigation.<sup>38</sup> If found guilty, Arnautov is facing up to six years in jail.
- 26. Suppression of freedom of expression online by Russian authorities is also evident in regard to transgender individuals. Michelle (whose real name is being withheld for privacy), a transgender woman, was arrested and sentenced to three years in a prison for men, under the anti-child pornography laws in connection with several anime drawings that Michelle posted to an inactive "Vkontakte" account more than seven years ago that each garnered between five and ten likes and did not draw any public attention at the time of posting. Prior to arrest, police hired a specialist that determined that age of the characters in the drawings is less than 14 years old. Despite discovering the images, police waited six months to arrest Michelle while gathering more evidence against her, and upon arrest confiscated Michelle's phone and laptop.<sup>39</sup> Michelle has since been released from prison.
- 27. The highly publicized cases of Tsvetkova, Arnautov and Michelle portray that Russian authorities are going out of their way to dig up information that may subject LGBTI individuals to charges under the traditional family values law or pornography laws. Despite minimal evidence in each of these cases, the individuals were silenced and held captive, as a result of expressing their thoughts and identities (and in Arnautov's case possibly not even being the one to disseminate information) through the Russian social media website.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Human Rights Committee, *Eighth Report Submitted by the Russian Federation under Article 40 of the Covenant, due in 2019*, (Apr. 8, 2019), U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/RUS/8, ¶¶ 379.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Суд в Комсомольске-на-Амуре оштрафовал ЛГБТ-активистку из-за публикаций во «ВКонтакте», Ovdinfo, Nov. 12, 2019, https://ovdinfo.org/express-news/2019/12/11/sud-v-komsomolske-na-amure-oshtrafoval-lgbt-aktivistku-iz-za-publikaciy-vo.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> В Хабаровске на ЛГБТ-активиста завели дело о распространении порнографии, Ovdinfo, Feb. 26, 2020, https://ovdinfo.org/express-news/2020/02/26/v-habarovske-na-lgbt-aktivista-zaveli-delo-o-rasprostranenii-

pornografii?fbclid=IwAR2\_sypppWmuzTdcbBjEA2Z6ZQx0JJXxPuCIazVnYTjdnVysjz0hIyBYOlM.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Sergei Hazov-Kassia, *Нетрадиционное бельё. Трансгендерная женщина в мужском СИЗО*, Svoboda, Feb. 3, 2020, https://www.svoboda.org/a/30412966.html.

### 28. Suggested questions:

- Please provide data about all cases in which Article 3 of the Labour Law has been invoked to respond to discrimination based on sexual orientation, gender identity, or gender expression in the reporting period, including whether a complainant raised such a claim, whether the court allowed the claim to proceed, and whether the court found a violation of the Labour Law on that basis. Has any court declined to apply Article 3 to a case alleging discrimination based on sexual orientation, gender identity, or gender expression?
- Please provide data about all criminal cases in the reporting period in which the victim alleged being targeted based on the victim's sexual orientation, gender identity, or gender expression. For each case, identify the whether a complaint was made, whether authorities undertook an investigation, whether a person was charged, the charging offense(s), the outcome of the case, any sentence or fine imposed, whether the penalty was suspended or deferred, and the reason for suspension or deferral.
- Please provide data disaggregated by jurisdiction, sex, age, race, and ethnicity for all cases in which individuals and other entities have been charged with violation of the law prohibiting propaganda promoting non-traditional sexual relations to minors. For each case, indicate the charged offense, the facts establishing a nexus between the alleged conduct and minors, the status of the proceeding, the outcome of the proceeding, and any penalties assessed.
- What remedies are available for persons who allege that they have been unlawfully detained based on their sexual orientation, gender identity, or gender expression? How many such complaints have been lodged and what has been the outcome of each complaint?
- What measures has the State Party taken to ensure that people are not denied access to healthcare or housing based on their sexual orientation, gender identity, or gender expression?
- What safeguards are in place to ensure that a person's parental rights are not curtailed or restricted based on their sexual orientation, gender identity, or gender expression?
- What measures have Russian authorities taken to ensure a full and independent investigation of all allegations of unlawful detention, torture, and other ill-treatment of LGBT individuals in the Republic of Chechnya? Please describe all measures taken to hold individuals accountable for such conduct and to offer remedies to victims.
- What measures has the State Party adopted to protect individuals from discrimination and violence based on sexual orientation, gender identity, or gender expression?
- Has the State Party clearly and officially stated that it does not tolerate any form of social stigmatization of homosexuality, bisexuality or transexuality, or hate speech, discrimination or violence against persons based on their sexual orientation or gender identity? What steps is the government of Russia taking to raise awareness in order to mitigate social prejudices, stigmatization, harassment, discrimination, and violence against LGBTI individuals?
- What steps has the State Party undertaken to ensure that a prosecuting authority participates in any oral hearing in administrative offence cases examined by courts of general jurisdiction so as to ensure the impartiality of the courts, so as to implement the decision of the European Court of Human Rights in *Karelin v. Russia*?

- Please comment on the status of the cases against LGBT activists Yulia Tsvetkova and Sergei Arnautov and please respond to the allegations that these prosecutions are based on thin evidence and are being used to restrict freedom of expression.
- What safeguards exist to ensure that officials are not invoking anti-pornography laws to target people based on their sexual orientation, gender identity, or gender expression for information they share on social media platforms?
- What training, if any, has been given to law enforcement to mitigate corruption, violence, and/or discrimination against LGBTI individuals?
- Have any members of law enforcement been prosecuted or otherwise held accountable for corruption, violence, and/or discrimination against LGBTI individuals? Please list all applicable cases. What measures, formal or informal, are in place to prevent and/or document these abuses by law enforcement? What measures are in place to hold law enforcement officers accountable for these abuses?
- What measures have been taken to protect LGBTI individuals from "honor killings" in Chechnya? Have any members of law enforcement been held accountable for encouraging these extrajudicial killings, or individuals prosecuted for committing them? Please list all applicable cases, and the outcome of each case.
- What measures have been taken to collect data on extrajudicial killings of LGBTI individuals? Please list all criminal cases, investigations, or reports involving the murder/killing of an individual due to that individual's perceived sexual orientation or gender identity.
- Has the State Party clearly and officially condemned extrajudicial killings, by stating that they will not be tolerated, and/or are illegal and will be punished according to the law?
- What steps has the State Party taken to identify, amend, repeal, or prevent the adoption of laws that are discriminatory toward LGBTI individuals?
- What steps has the State Party taken, if any, toward amending restrictions on driving to prevent discrimination against LGBTI individuals? Has the State Party taken any steps to remove or consider removing "transgender identity, bi-gender identity, asexuality and cross-dressing" from the list of contraindications to driving?
- What measures have been taken to prevent the law prohibiting promotion of non-traditional sexual relations to minors from being used to target LGBTI individuals?
- Has article 63, paragraph 1(e) of the Criminal Code been applied in any case involving violence against an LGBTI individual?