LESSON 3
The Rights of Immigrants in the United States

The bosom of America is open to receive not only the Opulent and respectable Stranger, but the oppressed and persecuted of all Nations and Religions; whom we shall welcome to a participation of all our rights and privileges.

~ George Washington, “Address to Irish Immigrants” (1783)
Goal
» Understand the rights of immigrants and the U.S. record in guaranteeing those rights.

Objectives
» Students will gain a general understanding of the rights of immigrants as outlined by U.S. law and international human rights treaties.
» Students will work together to determine how well the United States is fulfilling the rights of immigrants.
» Students will analyze news articles and other media about immigration from a human rights perspective.

Essential Question
» How well is the United States fulfilling the rights of immigrants?

Key Skill
» Analyzing news media (Activity 2).

Materials
☑ Handout 1: The Rights of Migrants in the United States
☑ Handout 2: Migrants in the Media.
☑ Example news article about immigration

Time Frame
3-4 class periods

Vocabulary
bias
human rights
immigrant
migrant
Procedure:

1. **Review.** Ask students to share what they have already learned about immigration and human rights. Revisit the definitions of immigrant, migrant, and human rights covered in Lesson 1 (on page 21) and Lesson 2 (on page 31). Read the following excerpt from the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR):

   “Everyone is entitled to all the rights and freedoms set forth in this Declaration, without distinction of any kind, such as race, color, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property or other status.”

   The quote emphasizes how everyone, regardless of immigration status or other characteristics, is entitled to basic human rights.

2. **Imagine.** Ask your students to imagine that they are an immigrant coming to a new country. Have the class generate a list of things that would be important to them. What would they need? What would they fear? What would they wish for? Students could work in small groups to generate more ideas. Write their ideas down on the board. As a class, compare this list with the rights contained in the UDHR (see Lesson 2 Handout 1: The Universal Declaration of Human Rights on page 37). What rights might be particularly important to migrants?

3. **Read.** Distribute Handout 1: The Rights of Migrants in the United States to the entire class. Ask the class to take 10 minutes to read the first page of the handout to familiarize themselves with the rights of migrants (some of this will have already been covered in Steps One and Two).

4. **Jigsaw.** The purpose of this activity is to help students become familiar with the rights of migrants as outlined by U.S. law and by international human rights treaties. Through this activity, the students will put together the pieces of the “jigsaw”, and learn from each other whether or not the United States is fulfilling the rights of migrants.

   1. **Form Groups.** Have students form groups of 2-3 (depending on the size of the class), and assign each group a subsection to read under “Is the U.S. Fulfilling the Rights of Migrants?” For example, one group would be responsible for reading “Humane Treatment in Detention.” Another group would be responsible for reading “Equal Protection and Due Process”, and so on.

   2. **Provide Example.** Demonstrate what students should look for in their fact sheet section by reading through the “Safety and Security” section as a class. Ask students to identify two facts that show the U.S. record in protecting that right (possible answers include: persistence of hate crimes, increased domestic violence, and border-crossing deaths).

   3. **Read and Choose.** Ask the students to take 10 minutes to read their assigned subsection. First, have the group read the definition of the right from the sidebar on the first page. Then, ask each group to choose two items to share from their subsection that show how well the United States protects the right being discussed.

   4. **Present.** After 10 minutes, ask each group to choose one spokesperson to present to the class on the definition of the right covered by their subsection, as well as the two items they chose to highlight. This should take approximately 25-30 minutes. Students should record the definitions and examples in their notebooks.

Procedure:

1. Research. Give each student Handout 2: Migrants in the Media. For this assignment, each student will use the internet and/or print media to identify and analyze one news article that deals with the issue of immigration in the United States. The article must be from a reputable news source, such as news magazines (e.g., Newsweek), newspapers (e.g., The New York Times), or a government publication (e.g., from the Department of Education). The students can use the subsections they discussed in Activity 3.1 to help them guide the search for their articles. Depending on time and resources, teachers can have students research this assignment at home or in class. If students do not all have internet access at home, it may be useful to set aside time for computer use during class or to provide hard copies of articles for students. If students are finding articles on the internet at home, they should print out hard copies to bring to class. (An optional variation of this exercise is to have students analyze articles on the same subject and published the same day or week from different sources to make bias and differences in coverage easier to detect.)

2. Analyze. Explain to students that news sources often have viewpoints or opinions about a subject, even if they do not explicitly state their opinion. One important task when reading a news article is to be alert to bias or opinions that could be influencing the reporting. Demonstrate to students the kind of analysis they will be undertaking in this activity by walking them through a sample news article and answering the questions on Handout 2 as a class. Then ask the students to analyze their own articles the same way, answering in writing the questions in Handout 2: Migrants in the Media. Students should be ready to discuss their answers with their classmates.

3. Small group discussion and presentation. Ask students to get in the same small groups they formed for the jigsaw. Ask them to take 15 minutes to discuss the answers they provided to each of the questions on their handout. After they have discussed each article, ask them to select one article they feel is particularly effective in demonstrating the fulfillment (or lack thereof) of a particular immigrant right, and to be prepared to paraphrase the article and summarize their analysis for the class.

Ask them to select one spokesperson to communicate this information to the rest of the class. When all of the groups are ready to present on their chosen article, take approximately 30-40 minutes to hear from all of the groups. As a class, evaluate the overall performance of the United States in protecting the rights of immigrants.

Questions for Discussion

- Did the information found in the newspaper articles support what they learned in Activity 3.1?
- What grade would students give the country?
- Based on what was discussed in the article, what kinds of actions need to be taken to ensure that the United States fulfills the rights of migrants?
# THE RIGHTS OF MIGRANTS IN THE UNITED STATES

## WHAT IS A MIGRANT?
A migrant is “any person who lives temporarily or permanently in a country where he or she was not born.” Migrants leave one place for another in search of a decent living or better education, to flee persecution, or simply to be close to family or friends.

Migration is an ancient and natural human response to hunger, deprivation, persecution, war, or natural disaster. Today, most governments regulate their borders and govern who enters or leaves the country. Migrants are classified based on their intent and the manner in which they enter a country. Tourists, business travelers, students, temporary workers, asylum seekers, refugees, permanent residents, and undocumented migrants all are part of the worldwide migrant population.

In 2010, an estimated 214 million people lived outside their country of birth. Approximately 42.8 million migrants live in the United States.

## WHAT ARE THE RIGHTS OF MIGRANTS?
International human rights apply to all human beings, regardless of immigration status. Everyone – citizen or migrant, documented or undocumented – enjoys basic human rights such as the right to life, liberty, and security of person; freedom from slavery or torture; the right to equal protection of the law and freedom from discrimination; freedom from arbitrary arrest and detention; the presumption of innocence; and freedom of association, religion, and expression.

These human rights are protected by international treaties, including the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR). Several treaties specifically address the human rights of migrants, including the Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and the Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families. These treaties outline rights of particular importance to migrants, including due process, family reunification, and asylum.

## DOES U.S. LAW RECOGNIZE THE RIGHTS OF MIGRANTS?
The U.S. Constitution guarantees most rights for all people in the United States, whether citizens or migrants, documented or undocumented. These include equal protection under the law, the right to due process, freedom from unlawful search and seizure, and the right to fair criminal proceedings, among many others. Other U.S. laws, such as those governing immigration proceedings, also grant rights to migrants.

The U.S. is also bound by international treaties such as the ICCPR, the Refugee Convention and the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD), all of which grant basic human rights to all peoples, including migrants.

## IS THE U.S. FULFILLING THE RIGHTS OF MIGRANTS?
Despite the commitments made in international and domestic law, the U.S. system often fails to protect the human rights of migrants. Certain domestic laws discriminate between citizens and migrants, or between documented and undocumented migrants, especially in the provision of basic social services. Migrants encounter prejudice and intimidation in the workplace and in society at large; unequal access to basic services such as health care, housing, and education; arbitrary infringement of their civil liberties; and the denial of their fundamental rights to due process.

## All Migrants Have a Right to:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SAFETY AND SECURITY</td>
<td>The right to life and personal security.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HUMANITY IN DETENTION</td>
<td>The right to be treated with respect and dignity while in detention.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EQUALITY AND DUE PROCESS</td>
<td>Equality before the law, freedom from arbitrary arrest and detention, and the right to a fair trial.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASYLUM</td>
<td>The right to seek safety in other countries from persecution.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAMILY UNITY</td>
<td>Legal migrants have a right to reunification with spouses and children in an expeditious manner.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NON-DISCRIMINATION</td>
<td>The right to live free from discrimination, especially on the basis of national origin.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FREEDOM FROM SLAVERY</td>
<td>The right to be free from slavery, servitude, and other forms of involuntary work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JUST WORKING CONDITIONS</td>
<td>Access to fair wages, a decent living, and workplace standards of safety, leisure, and health equivalent to U.S. citizens.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CULTURAL CONTINUITY</td>
<td>The right to enjoy their own culture, to practice their religion of choice, and to use their own language.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDUCATION</td>
<td>Equal access to K-12 education without regard to the citizenship status of parents or children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEALTH CARE</td>
<td>Medical care necessary for health and well-being, especially care that is urgently required for the preservation of life or the avoidance of irreparable harm to health.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOUSING</td>
<td>Access to adequate housing, without segregation or discrimination.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The U.S. lacks mandatory standards for immigration detention facilities, and as a result, migrants are frequently denied their rights to necessary medical care and humane conditions of detention. Virtually all immigrant detainees are held in prison-like settings, wear prison uniforms, are regularly shackled during transport and in their hearings, and are mingled with the general prison population. Immigrants in detention may be held for prolonged periods of time without access to the outdoors. Appropriate psychological and medical services for torture survivors are universally unavailable. Between 2003 and April 2009, Immigration and Customs Enforcement reported over 90 deaths of non-citizens in their custody, many as a result of denied medical care or suicide. Temporary holding facilities are even worse, with some holding cells essentially large cages in the desert, while in other cases, migrants are held on buses with inadequate food, water, and medical care.

Immigrants are also denied their right to effective representation. While U.S. law provides that migrants facing deportation have “the privilege of being represented,” representation must be “at no expense to the Government.” In 2008, approximately 57% of detainees in deportation cases were unrepresented, which limits the ability of migrants to present compelling cases on why they should be allowed to stay, especially given the complexities of the immigration system. Migrants with mental disabilities face even greater odds, since the immigration system routinely fails to take into account their competency to stand trial, even when they do not understand the charges being brought against them.

Asylum
Though the United States has ratified the Refugee Convention, certain policies in the asylum and refugee system deny protection to migrants who would face persecution or death if returned to their country of origin. U.S. law denies asylum to migrants who fail to file their claims within one year of arriving, which penalizes those most in need of protection, such as survivors of torture who struggle with memory loss, PTSD, depression, and other barriers to quickly applying for asylum. The United States also defines the risk of being tortured very narrowly, denying protection to many at-risk people. Finally, the United States bars individuals who have provided support to terrorist groups, but the definition is so broad that it covers peaceful political speech, assistance provided under coercion or threat of force, and even association with groups that support U.S. policies such as anti-Taliban fighters or Kurdish groups that fought against Saddam Hussein.

Family Unity
The right to maintain the unity of a family is one of the most fundamental human rights. The United States recognizes this by granting special preference to family members of immigrants who wish to join them in the United States. However, in practice, a strict quota system combined with slow processing times has led to an enormous backlog of visa applications – almost 3.5 million. As a result, migrants have waited years – and sometimes decades – before being reunited with family members. The United States also does not take into account family unity when enforcing immigration laws, detaining and deporting family members without considering the impact on families left behind. Over 1 million family members were separated by deportation between 1997 and 2007. U.S. law also establishes high penalties for unlawfully residing in the United States, forcing immigrants who may have entered illegally to spend up to 10 years apart from family members even after acquiring a pathway to legal status.
Migrants to the United States face serious barriers to economic prosperity and favorable working conditions. On average, 36
Just and Favorable Working Conditions
entirely on Hispanic ethnicity to justify stopping, questioning, searching, and detaining suspected undocumented migrants. 33
In Texas, allowing local police to enforce immigration laws led to a sharp increase in the numbers of Hispanics detained on minor misdemeanor charges compared to other races, even though most of those arrested were lawfully present in the United States. 34

After September 11, 2001, Arab and Muslim Americans were also victims of discrimination. The FBI questioned thousands of men of Middle Eastern descent despite having no evidence of their involvement in terrorist activity or even immigration violations, while new immigration policies target migrants from Middle Eastern and Muslim countries even when there is no evidence that the migrant poses a risk. 35

Freedom from Forced Labor
Both undocumented and documented immigrants can be victims of forced labor. The H-2 guestworker program allows people to enter the United States legally for temporary seasonal employment. Once here, these workers are vulnerable to exploitation and enslavement, including stolen wages, seizure of identity documents, poor living conditions, and denial of medical care for workplace injuries. 36 Many undocumented migrants end up in slavery-like situations as a result of human trafficking. While the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 was created to reduce trafficking violations, many victims are too afraid of their traffickers to report the crime and less than one percent of cases are solved annually. 37

Just and Favorable Working Conditions
Migrants to the United States face serious barriers to economic prosperity and favorable working conditions. On average, migrants have median weekly earnings that are less than 80% of the earnings of native-born Americans. 38 Many of the industries in which immigrants work, particularly in the agricultural and domestic services sectors, are excluded from minimum wage, overtime, trade union, and occupational health and safety laws. Employers also use the threat of deportation and workplace raids to discourage undocumented migrants and their co-workers from reporting labor law violations. 39

Cultural Continuity
The rights of individuals to enjoy their own culture and to practice the religion of their choosing are core American principles, and are generally well protected under the Constitution. The right of migrants to their own language, however, is under threat. Currently, at least 26 states have passed constitutional amendments or statutes declaring English to be the official language and limiting the circumstances in which other languages can be used for government business. 40 At the federal level, repeated efforts have been made to ban the use of non-English languages for official purposes, in violation of U.S. obligations under the ICCPR.

Education
Though migrant children enroll in elementary and high school at about the same rate as citizen children, they have worse educational outcomes. In most states, English Language Learners score between 30–40 percentage points lower than their classmates on national assessments. 41 In addition, undocumented migrant children are denied equal access to higher education in the United States. Under a 1996 federal immigration law, states are discouraged from providing in-state tuition, work-study, or financial aid to undocumented migrants. As a result, only 5–10% of undocumented migrants currently receive any post-secondary schooling. 42 These children, many of whom were brought by a parent at a young age and have lived and attended school in the United States for most of their lives, face limited job opportunities because they lack college degrees.

Health Care
Migrants suffer from unequal access to both health insurance and health care. Most legal migrants who have been in the United States for less than 5 years, as well as undocumented migrants, are denied access to federally funded health insurance programs such as Medicaid. As a result, 47% of non-citizens are uninsured as compared to 15% of citizens. 43 In addition, many states have statutory bans on providing non-emergency health care to undocumented migrants. As a result of these restrictions, migrants are far less likely to receive health care than citizens. A recent study found that 25% of migrants had not seen a doctor in the past 2 years compared to only 10% of citizens. 44

Housing
Migrants suffer from discrimination in their access to housing. Local governments use housing regulations to prevent migrants from moving to their areas, either by targeting immigrant residency patterns, such as large or extended-kin households, or by requiring verification of legal status before buying homes or renting apartments. 45 Between 2005 and 2007, thirty municipalities across the country made it a criminal offense to rent apartments to undocumented migrants. 46 Landlords and real estate agents also discriminate against migrants, discouraging them from living in particular areas or creating higher barriers for migrants who want to rent or purchase a home. Hispanic renters, for instance, were found to face discrimination in housing in 25% of cases studied by the Department of Housing and Urban Development. 47
Students: Your assignment is to find a news article that deals with the issue of immigration in the United States. You may use electronic or print media for your research. The article must be from a reputable news source, such as: news magazines (e.g., Newsweek), newspapers (e.g., The New York Times), or a government publication (e.g., from the Department of Education). Bring a printed copy of your article and the answers to the questions below to class. You will be asked to use this information further in a small group discussion and presentation.

Recommended News Sites:
- www.immigrationforum.org/press/clippings
- www.nytimes.com
- www.washingtonpost.com
- www.bbc.com (be sure to add “U.S.” to your search)
- www.cnn.com
- www.latimes.com
- www.msnbc.com

Questions Used to Analyze Articles:
On a separate piece of paper, answer the following questions regarding your chosen article on immigration. You may use the The Rights of Migrants in the United States fact sheet to help you identify the human rights issues presented in the article.

- What facts about U.S. immigration did you find in the article?
- What opinions about immigration did you find in the article?
- Was the article slanted or skewed in any particular way? If so, how? Can you list any words or phrases that show the bias contained in the article?
- Were any voices missing in the article? In other words, were there perspectives not included that would have been helpful in giving you a full understanding of the issue being discussed?
- In your view, was the article advocating for or against immigration? How about immigrant rights? What led you to this conclusion?
- Which of the immigrant rights included in The Rights of Migrants in the United States fact sheet were discussed in the article?
- What solutions were considered or proposed?
- Write at least two questions or ideas you have for further research.